EVALUATION FORM FOR ESSAYS TO PUBLISH ON «XY» JOURNAL

www.xydigitale.it

ESSAY TITLE _____

Proposed on _____, «XY» number _____

Identification number _____

EDITORIAL REVIEW

«XY» journal publishes only contributions submitted in **compliance with the editorial guidelines**, which are binding. If the judgment expressed in the following fields is not fully positive, **it is mandatory to make all the additions and changes** indicated.

Text, abstract, and keywords respect the limits

□ YES □ NO □ PARTIALLY

Any comment: _____

Bibliography and references are drawn up in accordance with the criteria set out

□ YES □ NO □ PARTIALLY

Any comment: _____

The essay complies with the guidelines on citations, references, notes, and text writing (e.g., use of capital letters, italics, and quotation marks)

□ YES □ NO □ PARTIALLY

Any comment: _____

Optional - English version is complete and written correctly

□ YES □ NO □ PARTIALLY

Any comment: _____

The images are of adequate quality and number, and the captions follow the expected models

□ YES □ NO □ PARTIALLY

Any comment: _____

Plagiarism Checker with Gemini AI

'Reasoning' mode: "You are an editor for a scientific journal and must check the attached document for plagiarism".

Result: _____

SCIENTIFIC REVIEW
Each essay is evaluated by two anonymous reviewers external to the journal's bodies. In case of a conflicting opinion, the text is sent to a third expert. In any case, the final decision is for the Director and the Scientific Committee of the journal.
The following questions are intended to remind the person responsible for the scientific review that «XY» welcomes, in its pages, specific thematic areas, with the aim of facilitating their comparison. The judgment of merit must be expressed irrespective of whether the thinking positions can or may not be shared (it is understood that: 1 = no way, 5 = totally).

Reviewer A's Name and Surname: _____
Date of review: _____

The proposed theme belongs to «XY»'s fields of interest
□ faces new theoretical and/or unpublished interdisciplinary connections
□ outlines new applied research procedures
□ exposes reflections on known experiences to rediscover and complete
Evaluation from 1 to 5: ____

Contents develop disciplinary fundamentals
□ with theoretical insights
□ in technical-methodological areas
□ with applications to concrete cases
Evaluation from 1 to 5: ____

The references mentioned in the text are relevant
□ because they carefully document the state of the art of research
□ thanks to the completeness of the bibliographic references
□ thanks to the suggestion of study paths to undertake
Evaluation from 1 to 5: ____

The iconographic apparatus enclosed in the text is expressive and effective
□ thanks to the singularity and pertinence of the images
□ thanks to the communicative and aesthetic value of the images
Evaluation from 1 to 5: ____

Exposure uses correct and clear language
□ and coherently articulates the scientific discourse (introduction, discussion of concepts, conclusions)
□ and convincingly presents the arguments, making them accessible for dissemination purposes
Evaluation from 1 to 5: ____

The essay is published with the following judgment
□ YES □ NO □ WITH CHANGES □ WITH CHANGES AND FURTHER REVIEW

Comments, directions, and motivations for the author of the essay (binding text, max 2000 credits)
_____

Any comments for the editorial staff (they will not be communicated to the author of the essay)
_____

Reviewer B's Name and Surname: _____
Date of review: _____

The proposed theme belongs to «XY»'s fields of interest
□ faces new theoretical and/or unpublished interdisciplinary connections
□ outlines new applied research procedures
□ exposes reflections on known experiences to rediscover and complete
Evaluation from 1 to 5: ____

Contents develop disciplinary fundamentals
□ with theoretical insights
□ in technical-methodological areas
□ with applications to concrete cases
Evaluation from 1 to 5: ____

The references mentioned in the text are relevant
□ because they carefully document the state of the art of research
□ thanks to the completeness of the bibliographic references
□ thanks to the suggestion of study paths to undertake
Evaluation from 1 to 5: ____

The iconographic apparatus enclosed in the text is expressive and effective
□ thanks to the singularity and pertinence of the images
□ thanks to the communicative and aesthetic value of the images
Evaluation from 1 to 5: ____

Exposure uses correct and clear language
□ and coherently articulates the scientific discourse (introduction, discussion of concepts, conclusions)
□ and convincingly presents the arguments, making them accessible for dissemination purposes
Evaluation from 1 to 5: ____

The essay is published with the following judgment
□ YES □ NO □ WITH CHANGES □ WITH CHANGES AND FURTHER REVIEW

Comments, directions, and motivations for the author of the essay (binding text, max 2000 credits)

_____

Any comments for the editorial staff (they will not be communicated to the author of the essay)

_____

FINAL EVALUATION (by the «XY» Editorial Team)

□ **Accept**

□ **Revision Required**

□ **Revision and Resubmission**

□ **Decline**